



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

| APPLICATION NO. | FILING DATE | FIRST NAMED INVENTOR | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO. | CONFIRMATION NO. |
|-----------------|-------------|----------------------|---------------------|------------------|
|-----------------|-------------|----------------------|---------------------|------------------|

10/677,708

10/02/2003

Jerry H. Stoller

SLRE.103540

9195

7590 07/10/2008
Walter R. Brookhart
Shook, Hardy & Bacon LLP
Suite 1600
600 Travis
Houston, TX 77002

EXAMINER

PRYOR, ALTON NATHANIEL

ART UNIT

PAPER NUMBER

1616

MAIL DATE

DELIVERY MODE

07/10/2008

PAPER

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

| | | | |
|------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| Office Action Summary | Application No. 10/677,708 | Applicant(s) STOLLER, JERRY H. | |
| | Examiner ALTON N. PRYOR | Art Unit 1616 | |

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 04 April 2008.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1,5-14,16-18,20-31 and 47-70 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1,5-14,16-18,20-31 and 47-70 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413) |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application |
| Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____ | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____ |

DETAILED ACTION

Applicant's arguments, see paper, filed 4/8/08, with respect to 35 USC 102(b) and 103(a) rejections have been fully considered and are persuasive. The rejections have been withdrawn. Applicant has amended claims to require both auxin and metal.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 1,5-14,16-18,20-22,25-31,47-70 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Clough (USPN 4496388; 1/29/85). Clough teaches a fungicidal composition comprising metal complex of the compound of formula I (abstract, column 6 lines 14-18). Clough teaches that the composition can comprise additional compounds such as auxins including indoleacetic acid, indole butyric acid, and naphthyacetic acid (column 11 lines 7-39), anionic surfactants including calcium lignosulphonate (column 10 lines 1-18) as well as ingredients such as calcium carbonate (column 9 lines 3-19). Clough teaches that the composition can exist in many forms including aqueous dispersions (column 9 lines 25-68). Clough teaches a method of controlling fungi such as phytophthora and rhizoctonia (column 6 lines 39-50) growth on plants such as coffee beans, soya beans and potatoes, i.e. monocots and dicots (column 6 lines 19-36, lines 55-66, column 7 lines 41-64), by applying the composition onto plants and/or their seeds. Clough does not exemplify an invention of controlling fungi by applying a

Art Unit: 1616

composition comprising metal complex of the compound of formula I, indoleacetic acid, indole butyric acid and calcium lignosulphonate onto plants and/or their seeds.

However, it would have been obvious to arrive at such an invention since Clough suggests the combination of ingredients to be applied to plants and/or their seeds to control fungi growth. Clough does not teach the invention of treating onion plants and/or their seeds with the auxin and metal mixture. It would have been obvious to do this since an onion plant is a monocot plant.

Claims 23 and 24 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Clough as applied to claims 1,5-14,16-18,20-22,25-31,47-70 above, and further in view of Drake et al (GB 1565906; 4/23/80) or Eden et al (4755397; 7/5/88). Clough teaches all that is recited in claims 23 and 24 except for the encapsulation of the auxin. Drake et al (abstract and claims) and Eden et al (entire reference) teach the encapsulation of actives such as fungicides to allow slow release of the fungicide. Therefore one having ordinary skill in the art would have been motivated to encapsulate the fungicide if slow release of the active was desired. The encapsulation of actives to gain slow release of the actives is a well known process.

Telephonic Inquiry

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to ALTON N. PRYOR whose telephone number is (571)272-0621. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:00 a.m. - 4:30 p.m..

Art Unit: 1616

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Johann Richter can be reached on 571-272-0646. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Alton N. Pryor/
Primary Examiner, Art Unit 1616